



# **Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru** **The National Assembly for Wales**

## **Y Pwyllgor Cyllid** **The Finance Committee**

**Dydd Mercher, 18 Gorffennaf 2012**  
**Wednesday, 18 July 2012**

### **Cynnwys** **Contents**

Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon  
Introduction, Apologies and Substitutions

Effeithiolrwydd Cyllid Strwythurol Ewropeaidd yng Nghymru—Tystiolaeth gan Gwerth Cymru  
Effectiveness of European Structural Funding in Wales—Evidence from Value Wales

Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd o'r Cyfarfod  
Motion under Standing Order No. 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public from the Meeting

Cofnodir y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir trawsgrifiad o'r cyfieithu ar y pryd.

The proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee. In addition, a transcription of the simultaneous interpretation is included.

#### **Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol** **Committee members in attendance**

Peter Black	Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Welsh Liberal Democrats
Christine Chapman	Llafur Labour
Jocelyn Davies	Plaid Cymru (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor) The Party of Wales (Committee Chair)
Paul Davies	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives

Mike Hedges	Llafur Labour
Ieuan Wyn Jones	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales
Julie Morgan	Llafur Labour

**Eraill yn bresennol**  
**Others in attendance**

Paul Griffiths	Gwerth Cymru Value Wales
Alison Standfast	Dirprwy Gyfarwyddwr (Caffael), Gwerth Cymru Deputy Director Value Wales (Procurement, Value Wales)

**Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol**  
**National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance**

Dan Collier	Dirprwy Glerc Deputy Clerk
Gareth Price	Clerc Clerk
Ben Stokes	Y Gwasanaeth Ymchwil The Research Service

*Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 9.28 a.m.*  
*The meeting began at 9.28 a.m.*

**Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon**  
**Introduction, Apologies and Substitutions**

[1] **Jocelyn Davies:** Welcome to this meeting of the Finance Committee. I remind you all to turn off your mobile phones and other electronic equipment. We are not expecting a fire drill, so if you hear the alarm, follow the directions of the ushers. We have received one apology from Ann Jones.

**Effeithiolrwydd Cyllid Strwythurol Ewropeaidd yng Nghymru—Tystiolaeth gan Gwerth Cymru**  
**Effectiveness of European Structural Funding in Wales—Evidence from Value Wales**

[2] **Jocelyn Davies:** We will move on to our first substantive item on the agenda, which is our inquiry into the effectiveness of European structural funding in Wales. We are to receive evidence from Value Wales, and I welcome the witnesses. Would you like to introduce yourselves for the record?

[3] **Ms Standfast:** My name is Alison Standfast, and I am the deputy director, so I look after the Value Wales division of the Welsh Government. This is Paul Griffiths. Would you like to introduce yourself, Paul?

[4] **Mr Griffiths:** I am Paul Griffiths. I work in Value Wales corporate procurement services, with particular responsibility for providing advice and guidance on procurement to the Department for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science. I was involved in the production of the procurement guidance that was provided by the Welsh European Funding Office to project sponsors.

[5] **Jocelyn Davies:** Thank you very much for that. If it is okay, we will go straight into questions. I will kick off with the first question. So, the WEFO guidance, which Mr Griffiths has explained came from him originally, sets out that the overriding principle behind the delivery of the current structural fund programme is to ensure a fair distribution of European Union funds that is effective in ensuring value for money. Can you tell us whether you believe that that has been achieved?

[6] **Ms Standfast:** I am not sure that we are close enough to have full evidence on that. My understanding is that, around that time, the WEFO department made a policy decision to encourage much greater use of procurement, and part of what you are looking at here is whether that policy move to procure a lot of the work has resulted in better use of the funds—*[Interruption.]*

[7] **Jocelyn Davies:** Can you just hold on? We seem to be having another technical problem this morning, and it could very well be that we will not be able to make a Record of what you are saying, so we will recap on that as soon as this is solved. It is not the first problem that we have had to solve this morning. We are unsure whether what we can hear is supposed to be in private session. We are checking on that and, if it is, we will suspend the meeting until this problem is solved, because that is what is being broadcast in this room at the moment.

[8] We will suspend the committee meeting, but if you do not mind, please stay in the room so that we can start again.

*Gohiriwyd y cyfarfod rhwng 9.31 a.m. a 9.51 a.m.  
The meeting adjourned between 9.31 a.m. and 9.51 a.m.*

[9] **Jocelyn Davies:** Thank you all for returning to the committee—*[Interruption.]* Our problem is obviously not solved.

*Gohiriwyd y cyfarfod rhwng 9.51 a.m. a 9.52 a.m.  
The meeting adjourned between 9.51 a.m. and 9.52 a.m.*

**Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd o'r  
Cyfarfod  
Motion under Standing Order No. 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public from  
the Meeting**

[10] **Jocelyn Davies:** I move that

*the committee resolves to exclude the public from the remainder of the meeting in accordance with Standing Order No. 17.42.*

[11] I see that the committee is in agreement.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion agreed.*

*Daeth rhan gyhoeddus y cyfarfod i ben am 9.52 a.m.  
The public part of the meeting ended at 9.52 a.m.*